

Exhibit 13: Process for Approving Language/Reading Instructional Materials

Reported by National Research Coordinators

SOURCE: IEA's Progress in International Reading Literacy Study - PIRLS 2016

Country	Description of Process
Australia	No process for approving instructional materials
Austria	Producers submit their textbooks/materials to the Federal Ministry of Education. The ministry has set up a commission evaluating the textbooks. The evaluation is based on criteria set out in the directives devised by the ministry. One important aspect is coverage of the entire curriculum. There is a long list of approved textbooks, but none of them is explicitly recommended. However, only approved textbooks are provided free of charge for schools and the teachers can freely choose from the list. But the teachers also can apply any other books or materials which are suitable.
Azerbaijan	All textbooks should be approved by the Ministry of Education.
Bahrain	The specialists in the Arabic Department in the Curricula Directorate revise the textbooks yearly to develop the contents and procedures. This revision is approved by the language experts and the consultants in the minister's office.
Belgium (Flemish)	No process for approving instructional materials
Belgium (French)	Workbooks must be approved by the steering commission of the Ministry of Education.
Bulgaria	The Bulgarian Ministry of Education and Science approves up to 3 textbooks (with their supplements) for each subject and for each grade. Each teacher then decides which of the approved textbooks to use for instruction.
Canada	In most provinces, there is a rigorous process for approving language/reading instructional materials. The level at which these approvals are done varies across provinces, but the process often involves provincial ministry personnel, school district/board personnel, teachers, or expert consultants.
Chile	The Ministry of Education opens a public tender for publishing houses to propose instructional materials, specifically, textbooks. The School Texts unit of the Ministry evaluates the materials proposed by the publishers in a long term process that involves both inside and outside evaluators. The allocated materials are delivered to each student in the public system.
Chinese Taipei	Commercial textbooks must be approved by the examining committee of Chinese. The committee members are appointed by the Ministry of Education.
Czech Republic	There is no process for approving instructional materials. However, the Ministry of Education, Youth, and Sport has developed a formal certification process to approve educational materials. The producers of educational materials (especially textbooks and practice books) can undergo the certification process for free. Because certification declares rightness and accuracy of the educational material content, certified instructional material comes with prestige. While schools can use any instructional materials they wish, schools tend to use these Ministry-approved materials.
Denmark	No process for approving instructional materials. In special cases, the school board must approve materials.
Egypt	Textbooks must be approved by the Ministry of Education.
England	Generally there is no official process of approving instructional material but the Department for Education has produced a catalogue of "approved" products and training for some language/reading areas such as phonics.
Finland	No process for approving instructional materials
France	No process for approving instructional materials
Georgia	In order for a publisher to acquire the right to sell textbooks to public schools, the textbooks should be licensed by a committee at the Ministry of Education and Science. The books are then purchased and disseminated for free among students in public schools.
Germany	The process varies by state. Sometimes (e.g., Brandenburg) all instructional materials are generally approved. Sometimes approval is made based on information provided by publishers that the material is compliant with curricula. Especially in larger states, there are approval procedures. For example, in Bavaria, basic readers, workbooks, reading books, and other books for study and reflection and language use are reviewed. State ministries or regional institutes for schools commission experts to conduct the review whether instructional materials are to be included in the approved list.
Hong Kong SAR	Both printed and electronic textbooks are required to submit to the Education Bureau (EDB) for approval before publication and roll out in the market. The EDB conducts a double-blind review process. Textbooks that have been reviewed by the EDB and meet acceptable standards are classified as "Recommended" and included on the Recommended Textbook List.
Hungary	Textbooks have to go through an accreditation process with the Educational Authority (which is an institute of the Ministry of Education).

A dash (-) indicates data not provided.

Exhibit 13: Process for Approving Language/Reading Instructional Materials (Continued)

Country	Description of Process
Iran, Islamic Rep. of	Instructional materials are approved by the curriculum council in the Organization for Educational Research and Planning, a committee of selected teachers, secretariats in provinces, and through assessment research conducted by the Research Institute for Education.
Ireland	No process for approving instructional materials
Israel	Both Hebrew and Arabic textbooks as well as other learning materials are developed by not-for-profit organizations and universities, or by commercial agencies and publishers, but must be approved by the Ministry of Education. The process of approval of instructional materials involves review by anonymous experts of pre-published versions to evaluate the compatibility of the content of the instructional material to the discipline at hand, the pedagogical and didactical aspects, the syllabus, and the curriculum policy. Although the criteria are curriculum-based, the approved materials are quite varied, allowing teachers to choose their own textbooks.
Italy	Textbooks are chosen by school teachers and adopted by teacher committees with input from interclass or class councils and parent representatives.
Kazakhstan	An approved list of textbooks and teaching aids for language learning is recommended by the Academy of Sciences.
Kuwait	Textbooks and workbooks must be approved.
Latvia	The National Centre for Education evaluates and approves textbooks, workbooks, and other materials which contain curriculum content, theory, and practice along with tasks and exercises for learning and evaluation.
Lithuania	In order to be included in a textbook database, a textbook must receive positive reviews from independent experts and confirmation of a Lithuanian language committee, stating that the textbook corresponds to literary language requirements set out in Lithuanian language law. The choice of textbook used for learning is the responsibility of the teaching staff, so schools and teachers can choose approved textbooks from an official database and buy them using pupils' basket money.
Macao SAR	No process for approving instructional materials
Malta	A board is set up to evaluate materials. Texts are selected and recommendations are made for schools with regard to the choice of materials. Schools themselves may also evaluate and choose the materials to implement the curriculum.
Morocco	Relying on the curriculum and the principle of multiple textbooks, terms of reference were worked out and textbooks were designed according to a specified timetable. These textbooks were later validated by an ad hoc committee. Some digital resources were produced by the GENIE directorate within the project of using ICT in education. These were based on the content of the curriculum for each level and they were later validated. However, there are still problems in exploiting these resources to the fullest.
Netherlands	No process for approving instructional materials
New Zealand	No process for approving instructional materials
Northern Ireland	No process for approving instructional materials
Norway (5)	No process for approving instructional materials
Oman	Textbooks, teacher guides, and teaching resources are developed by the curriculum department and must be approved by the Minister of Education. A committee that consists of curriculum experts, evaluation officers, subject supervisors, and teachers is assigned to develop the curriculum, which is then sent to be revised by experts, academic personnel, supervisors and teachers. After approval, printing processes are put in place. E-learning resources provided in the portal, which is designed by schools and teachers and revised by the curriculum general directorate.
Poland	-
Portugal	Textbooks must be approved and certified by the Education-General Directorate (DGE) of the Ministry of Education. Pedagogical boards within the schools' clusters can then select the books they want to use from the DGE's list of approved textbooks.
Qatar	Textbooks, activity books, and online materials are subject to approval.
Russian Federation	There is a federal list of textbooks recommended for use and approved by the Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation. Each year, the Ministry of Education and Science of the Russian Federation makes additions to this list.
Saudi Arabia	Textbooks, workbooks, and technology materials are subject to approval.
Singapore	The Ministry of Education provides an approved list of instructional materials for teaching reading and the English language, such as: reading texts, teaching guidelines, supplementary workbooks and online instructional materials. Curriculum Planning Officers at the Ministry of Education conduct a comprehensive review of the materials before they are approved. Schools are allowed to choose whether to use all or some of the materials and are recommended to use at least 80% of the materials.

SOURCE: IEA's Progress in International Reading Literacy Study - PIRLS 2016

Exhibit 13: Process for Approving Language/Reading Instructional Materials (Continued)

Country	Description of Process
Slovak Republic	The Ministry of Education, Science, Research, and Sport of the Slovak Republic (MŠVVaŠ SR) announces competitions for textbooks with specific requirements, and various authors can apply. Once approved by a specially-assembled committee and two reviewers, authors submit draft textbooks to the National Institute for Education (SPU) or National Institute for Professional Education (SIOV). If requirements are met, SPU or SIOV complete an approval report used by MŠVVaŠ SR to issue "approval closure." There can be various textbooks with approval closure for a particular subject. Approved textbooks are listed in a national register of textbooks from which schools may choose and receive textbooks free of charge. MŠVVaŠ SR is allowed to pass a "recommendation clause" for a textbook. If a school chooses a textbook with a recommendation clause, the school pays full price for the textbook and there is no refunding from the Ministry of Education. The usage of textbooks is not compulsory.
Slovenia	Textbooks used in schools are approved by the National Expert Council for General Education. There are several textbooks available for individual subjects. The school makes an autonomous decision on the textbooks, study notebooks, and other teaching aids used in the school and has to seek approval from the council of parents for its selection. Pupils may borrow textbooks free of charge from a textbook fund that operates in schools.
South Africa	The approval of all teaching and learning materials is centralized. The national department, in conjunction with the respective provincial departments, approves all the materials including language/reading materials used in public schools. National workbooks for all subjects, including language, are commissioned centrally at the national level and are issued for use in all public schools. The approved lists for textbooks are issued by the department of education and schools may only order and use these as primary sources. The teachers may supplement their own textbooks with alternative materials, including other non-approved textbooks. However, textbooks issued to students must be on the approved lists.
Spain	The National Curriculum does not specify a process for approving instructional materials. The communities are the ones that will develop the process to approve the materials that will be used.
Sweden	No process for approving instructional materials
Trinidad and Tobago	No process for approving instructional materials
United Arab Emirates	Textbooks, workbooks, and online materials are all approved by a committee of experts in Arabic language. They refine the materials and choose those that best suit students.
United States	Many states allow school districts or schools to choose the textbooks and instructional materials they will use. However, some states, known as textbook adoption states, select, approve, or recommend the textbooks used by districts and schools. School districts in many of the states also have a process for approving or recommending textbooks and materials, while other districts leave the decision to individual schools.

Benchmarking Participants—Responses Pertain to Benchmarking Provinces/Regions/Emirates/States

Buenos Aires, Argentina	At state-run primary schools, a language curriculum commission chooses four or five textbooks and teacher's manuals annually from which teachers select to use with their students that year. In the private sector, the selection of the instructional materials for reading instruction is open and teachers choose textbooks and manuals that they prefer.
Ontario, Canada	Textbooks that have been approved by the Ministry for school board acquisition are posted on "Trillium List," the ministry's list of approved textbook titles. Prior to being posted on "Trillium List," textbooks go through a stringent evaluation process to meet government requirements. These textbooks must support 85% of the curriculum, as well as the philosophy and intent of the curriculum.
Quebec, Canada	For French as a language of instruction, since 1980, the Bureau d'approbation du matériel didactique (BAMD) has evaluated and approved instructional materials, using criteria approved by the Minister and developed in accordance with the orientations and content of programs of study that have received ministerial approval. Seven aspects are taken into consideration in evaluating instructional packages submitted for approval: pedagogical aspects, sociocultural aspects, material aspects, advertising aspects, toponymical aspects, conventional aspects, and appropriateness of religious content. The approval system ensures that all materials comply with the provisions of the Education Act that concern instructional materials. On the website of the BAMD, the Ministère posts only the official list of approved materials. For English as a language of instruction, since instructional material is children's literature, non-fiction texts, popular texts, and media texts, the same formal process does not occur.
Denmark (3)	No process for approving instructional materials. In special cases, the school board must approve materials.
Norway (4)	No process for approving instructional materials
Moscow City, Russian Fed.	The Ministry of Education of Russia develops and approves instructional materials for use in primary education. Each set of materials consists of a reader with a collection of texts, a textbook that supplements the reader, student work booklets for answering oral and written questions, books for family reading, and a teacher's guide. The Ministry of Education releases a list of recommended books.

Exhibit 13: Process for Approving Language/Reading Instructional Materials (Continued)

Country	Description of Process
Eng/Afr/Zulu - RSA (5)	The approval of all teaching and learning materials is centralized. The national department, in conjunction with the respective provincial departments, approves all the materials including language/reading materials used in public schools. National workbooks for all subjects, including language, are commissioned centrally at the national level and are issued for use in all public schools. The approved lists for textbooks are issued by the department of education and schools may only order and use these as primary sources. The teachers may supplement their own textbooks with alternative materials, including other non-approved textbooks. However, textbooks issued to students must be on the approved lists.
Andalusia, Spain	No process for approving instructional materials
Madrid, Spain	The National Curriculum does not specify a process for approving instructional materials. The communities are the ones that will develop the process to approve the materials that will be used.
Abu Dhabi, United Arab Emirates	Teacher's guides, reading books (stories), and reading kits are created or developed centrally and tried for one year while receiving feedback from the field and then approved.
Dubai, United Arab Emirates	Textbooks, workbooks, and online reading materials must be approved.

SOURCE: IEA's Progress in International Reading Literacy Study - PIRLS 2016